Government should take the management as a last resort. That is the policy to be followed. Government as it is constituted to-day by the popular Ministry, I do it with the greatest interest to see that the popular Ministry does not come in for criticism.

Mr. President: I ask the Hon'ble Member to bring his speech to a close.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* Therefore this is the advice. Do not go in for the management of the high school if it is humanly possible for the Government of Cochin to do that. But go in for the assumption of the Primary School at least in the case of free surrender of management. That is the suggestion if you are willing to take it. Let not the money of the tax payer be frittered away.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* I will take a few minutes.

Mr. Parambi Lonappen *(Irinjalakkuda):* There are other members to speak.

The House rose for lunch at 1-30 p.m. and re-assembled after lunch at 2-30 with the Deputy President in the Chair

VI. NOMINATION OF A MEMBER TO THE MAHARAJA'S TECHNOLOGICAL INSTITUTE ADVISORY BOARD

Deputy President: There is an announcement that nominations for the election of a member to the Maharaja's Technological Institute Advisory Board will be received by the Secretary to the Council up to 5 p.m. on Thursday, the 6th February 1947.

VII. DEMANDS FOR SUPPLEMENTARY GRANTS—*(cont.)*

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ് കെ. വർഗ്ഗീസ്: ഈ ബഡ്ജറ്റോപക്ഷേപത്തെ അനുകൂലിക്കാതെ എനിക്കു നിവൃത്തിയില്ല. തൃശ്ശിവപേരൂരിൽ പള്ളിവക ഒരു ലോവർസെക്കന്ററി സ്കൂൾ നടത്തിവരുന്നുണ്ട്. അതു വളരെക്കാലമായി നടന്നുവരുന്ന ഒരു സ്കൂളാണ്. ഗവൺമെണ്ടിൽനിന്ന് ഇങ്ങിനെയുള്ള ഒരു സ്കൂൾ ഏറ്റെടുക്കണമെന്ന നിശ്ചയിച്ചതു് ഏതോ ഒരു ശുദ്ധശക്തിയുടെ പ്രേരണമൂലമാണെന്നിരുന്നാലും ഒരു സ്കൂൾ വീടുകൂടാതെ ഏറ്റെടുത്തു നടത്തണമെന്നുള്ളതാണ് ഉദ്ദേശമെങ്കിൽ പള്ളിക്കാരുടെ സ്കൂൾ എടുത്താൽ മതിയായിരുന്നു. ഇതു് ഏതോ ഒരു ഗവൺമെണ്ടുദ്യോഗസ്ഥൻ പെൻഷൻ പറ്റിയതിനുശേഷം അദ്ദേഹം തുടങ്ങിയതായ ഒരു സ്കൂളാണ്. ഇതു തുടങ്ങിയിട്ടു് നാലഞ്ചു കൊല്ലമേ ആയിട്ടുള്ളൂ. ഹിൽപാഡി തോറ്റപ്പോൾ അതു് ഗവൺമെണ്ടിന്റെ തലയിൽ വെച്ചുകെട്ടിയതുപോലെ ഇതും കെട്ടിവെയ്ക്കുവെന്നല്ലാതെ ഇതിൽ വേറെ യാതൊരു ഉദ്ദേശവും ഉണ്ടെന്നു തോന്നുന്നില്ല.

Mr. S. P. Luiz *(Nominated):* Mr. Deputy President, I am constrained to participate in the discussion at this stage merely on a point of principle before I proceed further I will be obliged if the Hon'ble Minister will kindly furnish me with the information as to whether any suggestion has been received by Government regarding the assumption of management of this High School.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* Absolutely none.

Mr. S. P. Luiz *(Nominated):* Thank you I am afraid that the policy adopted by the Government in this particular case does not warrant much of good taste and policy. On the face of the facts there are several hundreds and hundreds of educational institution that would gladly seek the assistance of the Government to hand over the management provided they are prepared to take it. I am not aware of the geographical position of the school and the schools nearby. I do not know the exact distance between them But just on point of principle namely Government assuming management of the institutions within such a limited space without any sort of gesture. I support the motion.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* I am extremely happy to listen to a very useful suggestion given to me by the Hon'ble Member for Vadakkancheri regarding the policy which Government ought to follow in the matter of assumption of schools. In fact several recommendations are pending before the Government regarding the assumption of management of primary schools. The permanent Director of Public Instruction has made recommendations to assume several primary schools by Government, and those recommendations have been scrutinised by the Educational Advisory Committee also. These recommendations will be accepted, I mean examined, and the case of each school will be considered on its merits and before the reopening of schools in Edavam, final orders will be passed on these recommendations. The Hon'ble Member for Vadakkancheri said that although there were these recommendations pending before the Government orders have not yet been passed. In fact I have been waiting to consider what ought to be the policy of Government in these matters. The

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Hon'ble Member has moved this cut motion in order to make certain suggestion and he has made his suggestions and when three other Hon'ble friends said that they supported the cut motion I take it to mean that they supported the suggestion because the cut motion as conceived by the Hon'ble Member is not against the assumption of school because if it was so it would have been a motion for abolition of the grant of Rs. 10,000.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* It will come in proper time.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Eduction):* What are the suggestions placed before the Government by the Hon'ble Member? As far as possible when management of primary schools come forward with the offer that they will surrender their institutions freely to Government, the Government must jump at the idea and assume these schools. I have pleasure to say that as far as possible the Government will do it (A voice dangerous clause). In fact that was what the Hon'ble Member suggested. Regarding the secondary schools he said that as far as possible secondary schools should not be assumed by Government.

Now, Sir, Government have placed certain principles before it. The mere fact that a manager cannot conduct the school will be no reason why Government will assume that school. If simultaneously Government are satisfied that the school is a necessity for the locality educational necessity for the locality and if Government do not come forward and take up that school there will be a lacuna there in the matter of educational facilities, then the Government will assume that school.

Now, Sir, one of the main principles accepted by the Government is that Government is not for supporting the theory that all schools should be owned by Government. Proper scope will be given for private individuals and institutions to conduct schools. But every secondary school cannot be handed over to private agancies. Some schools will be Government owned and ample scope will be given for private agencies to conduct schools. Coming to the very particular school I hope nobody raised the question about the necessity of the school there. The fact that the school was recognised by Government two years ago shows that there is necessity for a secondary school there. In this particular case, Sir, both department *i.e.*, the Director of Public Instruction and the Educational Advisory Committee and the Government came to the unanimous conclusion that this school is a local necessity and unless Government assume that school, the school may fall down. Nobody made any offer, no private individual made any offer to assume the management of the school. I never knew that there was any private body which assume management of this school. If it were so that question would have been considered. But that being so, and locality of Kuttur being a place where a school is necessary, Government assumed that school. Government are thankful to the Hon'ble mover for the very valuable suggestion placed before the Government in the matter of assumption of schools and before final policy is laid down, I can assure the Hon'ble Member and the House that the weightly suggestions placed by him before me will be considered and the views explained by him before the House will be taken into consideration. That being so and the cut motion being one intended to place certain suggestions before Government, I hope the Hon'ble Mover will not press the cut motion.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* I am prepared to oblige my Hon'ble friend though I am not in the least satisfied with his observations upon the policy but to tell him what it is and how it is going to be, I have got other opportunities and therefore I am at this juncture prepared to oblidge my Hon'ble friend and I beg leave of the House to withdraw the cut motion.

Mr. M. K. Raja *(Mulakunnathukavu):* On a point of information, Sir, I understand the Minister to say that orders will be passed about the assumption of these primary schools which have been sanctioned by the Advisory Committee within a reasonable time.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* Not on all. The fact that the Advisory Committee made recommendations only shows that it is a fit case for consideration by Government.

Mr. M. K. Raja *(Mulakunnathukavu):* But I understand that no orders have been passed on the recommendations of the Advisory Committee for assuming management of those 22 schools.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* That is because it is too early to pass orders on that matter.

Mr. M. K. Raja *(Mulakunnathukavu):* I just want to know what will be the time limit within which orders will be passed.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* I am not in a position to say now what the time limit will be. The question of primary education is now under contemplation of Government. In fact as Hon'ble Members may be aware that I am carrying on discussions and negotiations with the managers of schools and consnlting with educational experts of the Government and we are also having a compulsory Free Primary Education Bill on the anvil of the legislature. With all these considerations in mind Government will have to come to a final decision in this matter.

(by leave withdrawn)

Deputy President: The question before the House is for a grant of Rs. 10,000 under "21-Education-11-Miscellaneous 12-Lump sum provision for assumption of schools.".

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuhassan *(Vadakkancheri):* I oppose the Motion, for the grant of Rs. 10,000, for the assumption of this Chandra Memmorial School, for the reasons stated in the notes and the speech made by the Hon'ble Minister for Education.

Now, Sir, the cut motion which was just withrawn was to ascertain from Government whether there is any policy regarding this assumption of management. That it was refused, that enquiry was refused and I was asked to go on with my suggestions which I made and the suggestions made have been agreed to be looked by the Hon'ble Minister. But all the same my specific suggestion that it is only as a very last resort that Government and more especially the Government of Cochin as it is constituted to-day by the Cabinet System of Government with education in the hands of a popular minister, it is in the very last resort that assumption of management of schools; should be taken up by Government. This is a proposition which could have been and ought to have been categorically accepted by the Hon'ble Minister who is responsible to the tax-payers of Cochin. That has unfortunately not come from him. My esteemed friend with his adroitness in arguments has complemented me for the very valuable suggestions according to him given out by me, emphasising upon the fact that, where there is absolute necessity even on the case of assumption of schools was made by the Government. He takes his stand upon that and those who supported the motion he characterises as having supported the suggestion being what was stated by me earlier. That was the way in which he looks at my suggestions.

Now, Sir, with the very valuable explanation given by the Hon'ble Minister on this subject and with special reference to this school and its assumption that the school was started only two years back, the request came that it may be assumed otherwise it will be given up. An examination was conducted by a competent body. That body recommended that it may be assumed. An observation was made by the Hon'ble Minister that no private interest, no private agency, came forward to assume the management. He made the assertion, Sir, and I do not question the asscertion. But I put the question, did the Hon'ble Minister in charge of education who is to administer the funds at his disposal to the best interests of the tax-payer and not to the interest of an individual, the individual in this being the manager concerned. Did he in that view conduct any enquiry in the locality or any where for that matter that whether there is any private agency coming forward to assume the management taking it over from the present manager. That enquiry has not been suggested to have been made by the Hon'ble Minister. I charge the Minister for having failed to make that enquiry. That being so, Sir, the only alternative left to me is to oppose this mighty big demand viewed from the tax-payer's view, of Rs. 10,000 to pay as compensation.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* No, Sir,

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* I am reading from the notes "an expenditure of Rs. 10,000 is estimated to be necessary towards the establishment charges, cost of site, building, etc., since no provision exists in the budget for this."

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* I can inform the Hon'ble Member the cost towards sites and buildings amounts to Rs. 5,000 although it costs much higher.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* Now I am informed that the bargain has been a very good one for Government. Should Government go in for bargaining like this? Now on payment of the sum of Rs. 5,000 just half the total demand for the site which I know what it is, for building which I immediately describe that if a veritable smoker like me goes there with a lighted cigar you will not have to pay for it because it will vanish into thin air.

Mr. Puthur Achutha Menon *(Kattur):* Please don't do it.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* Of course I will not do it. That is the structure under which the children of the tax-payar are asked to be seated for getting instructions to be developed into responsible ministers of the State hereafter *(laughter)* That is the sort of building that you are going to pay Rs. 5,000. I speak with intensity of feeling for the simple reason that I had occasion to visit the spot and that I know the building, the nature of the building, does cost even Rs. 5,000, much less than that. If the idea of the Government is to pay some money to the old manager which I believe at least to compensate and if the idea is not for this matter the Government should withdraw its hands and the popular Government and more so the Education Minister of the type and calibre like the Hon'ble Minister for Education is the man who has to do it. This is not a disparagement but a complement which he deserves. I ask whether the Minister will rise to the full stature and see that this frittering away of the funds of the tax-payer is not done by him. In the interests of the educational needs of the State but in some other interest which without my mentioning it you have been able to understand from the explanation of the Minister.

Mr. Puthur Achutha Menon *(Kattur):* I have not understood it.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* It is impossible to make persons of that type to understand. Persons who will not be influenced by arguments say that they do not mind if I aim to attempt to penetrate into the heads of the Hon'ble Members like my esteemed friend, the deputy leader of the Prajamandal Party.

Now, Sir, on the question of questions whether you should spend the tax-payers money to the tune of Rs. 10,000 for assuming this management of the school I say definitely, I am sure, that the voting on this question, because I am going to press to a division, will not be on its merits, but on the brute force of numerical strength. I am sure that the grand success will be one which will be remembered by the public of Cochin—the tax-payers and the Ministers, name will be recognised, commended and praised. The question is whether the Minister goes in for that or goes for that criticism that will be levelled upon him by his own tax-payer. I say his own tax-payer for these reasons because the Government is described as his own Government. I submit that for the reasons that I stated earlier although the Committee examined and found the necessity for the school I have established the case that there is no necessity for running a school there at Government cost. It is not too much to expect grown up students who are wasting their time and energy by propaganda on exploiters. It is not too much to expect them to walk a distance of one or two miles to Tirur High School or 2 miles to the C. M. S. or three miles to the Velangans High School run by the Ramkrishna Mission. Therefore, the necessity has not been established. Rs. 10,000 is not a small amount to be frittered away like this, especially in view of the fact that in reply to the query by the Hon'ble Member from Mulakunnathukavu regarding the very school, the Minister had replied in the negative. Sir, I have thrown out a suggestion to be followed by the Minister at this juncture to defer this demand to a later occasion after probing into the question in its proper perspective.

Mr. Puthur Achutha Menon *(Kattur):* May I know the names of the members of the Advisory Committee?

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education):* The members of the Educational Advisory Committee are Mr. M. K. Raja, Mr. P. A. Mohammed Ashroff and Mr. K. S. Panicker.

Mr. K. S. Panicker *(Trichur-Ezhuvas):* I was not in this Committee then.

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ് കെ. വർഗ്ഗീസ്സ്: രണ്ടുമൂന്നു കൊല്ലങ്ങൾക്കുള്ളിൽ ഈ സ്കൂളിനെ നല്ല ഭാഷയിലാക്കണമെങ്കിൽ എത്രായിരം ഉറുപ്പിക ചിലവുവരും?

മിസ്റ്റർ പി. ഗോവിന്ദമേനോൻ: ഇപ്പോൾ നല്ലഭാഷയിലുള്ള ഒരു സ്കൂളാണിതു്.

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ് കെ. വർഗ്ഗീസ്സ്: സ്കൂളിലെ ഭാഷയെ സംബന്ധിച്ചല്ല ചോദിക്കുന്നതു്. ആ കെട്ടിടത്തിന്റെ ഭാഷ എത്രനിലയിലാണെന്നാണു് ചോദ്യം.

മിസ്റ്റർ പി. ഗോവിന്ദമേനോൻ: ബഹുമാനപ്പെട്ട മെമ്പർ ചോദിച്ചതു് സ്കൂളിന്റെ ഭാഷയെപ്പറ്റിയാണെങ്കിൽ ഭാഷക്ക യാതൊരു തരക്കേടുമില്ല.

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ് കെ. വർഗ്ഗീസ്സ്: ഭാഷയെപ്പറ്റി അറിയുവാനായിട്ടു് പ്രസംഗിക്കുവാനും മാല സ്വീകരിക്കുവാനും മംഗളപത്രം സ്വീകരിക്കുവാനുമായി വല്ലപ്പോഴും അവിടെ പോയിട്ടുണ്ടോ?

മിസ്റ്റർ പി. ഗോവിന്ദമേനോൻ: ഭാഷ അറിയാനായിട്ടു് മീറ്റിംഗിൽ പ്രസംഗിക്കയൊ പ്രിസൈഡ് ചെയ്യുയോ ഒന്നും ആവശ്യമില്ല. ഭാഷ അറിയാവുന്നവക്കൊക്കെ ഭാഷ നല്ലതാണെന്നറിയാം.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. K. S. Panicker *(Trichur-Ezhuvas)* : I was not in the Committee then. I emphatically refute the suggestion made by the Hon'ble Member for Wadakkancheri that the school was proposed to be assumed in order to accommodate anybody. Government came to the conclusion on the materials placed before it both by the Department of Education and also the Educational Advisory Committee that this school ought to be assumed.

Mr. K. Balakrishna Menon *(Cheruthuruthi)*: What are those materials?

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)*: The report of the Director of Public Instruction.

Mr. K. Balakrishna Menon *(Cheruthuruthi)*: In the report what are the materials?

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)*: The school was recognised a few years ago.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkacheri)*: When please?

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)*: It was recognised long before it was contemplated to be assumed. The very fact that it was recognised shows that there is necessity for a school there. There is a very great strength in the school.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuhassan (*Vadakkancheri*) : What is the strength please?

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)*: More than 40, in the fourth form. Again when the Hon'ble Member said that the High School at Tirur is only one and half miles away, I must take exception to that because it is a wrong statement. The distance must not be less than 3 or 4 miles and the School at Velangans is also far distant. In these days when education is spreading throughout the country when there is demand for high schools in every locality and high schools are opened even in rural parts, I must say that it is a travesty of facts that Kuttur village does not stand in need of a separate high school. Then the question is whether this school of Kuttur is not assumed the local educational needs will suffer. Government after due enquiry came to the conclusion that the educational needs of the locality will suffer unless there is a school there and Government also came to the conclusion that the present manager is not in a position to conduct the school.

Sir, there have been absolutely no offer placed before the Government to take up the school. When I made the statement I must not be taken to mean that if there is any offer it will be accepted, because always the questions will be considered on the merits in any of these cases. There may be cases where offers will not be accepted because, Sir, of late there has been a lot of complaints from students as well as teachers about their condition in private schools. Let it not be taken that I am against private management of schools. My views are well-known, even to the Hon'ble Member for Wadakkancheri who opposed, resigned and went away from my party because the party took a decision with regard to private management of Schools in the State.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri)*: No no. The primary schools will not be assumed.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)*: The State will not have monopoly in the case of primary schools. It will be remembered that the Hon'ble Member who attributed motives to me resigned from my party when it stood for assumption of private schools.

Mr. Parambi Lonappen (*Irinjalakkuda*): We are not interested in party quarrels in this House.

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ് കെ. വള്ളിസ്സ്: ഈയ്യിടെ കൊടകരയിൽ ഒരുപ്പിക വാടകക്ക് ഒരു പ്ലാം ഒരു പ്രൈവറ്റ് ഏജൻസിയെ ഏല്പിച്ചുകൊടുത്തിട്ടുണ്ടോ എന്നറിഞ്ഞാൽകൊള്ളാം.

Mr. P. Govinda Mnon (*Minister for Food and Education*): Therefore why I referred to Mr. Kumaran Ezhuthassan's view on this matter is to give proper colour to my views.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri)*: I am being mis-quoted. I resigned from the party not because of their decision for intending to accept the recommendation of the Committee that in course of time the management of primary schools will be assumed by Government. This is a matter of secondary schools.

മിസ്റ്റർ ജോസ് കെ. വർഗ്ഗീസ്: എന്തെ ചോദ്യത്തിനു മറുപടികിട്ടിയിട്ടില്ല.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)*: I am replying to a motion opposing a demand of Rs. 10,000 for the High School at Kuttur and when I am answering that, I refuse to answer any question on any other subject. Therefore Government came to the conclusion that the locality of Kuttur does require a Hig Shchool. Government further came to the conclusion that the present manager is unable to conduct the school. Government further came to the conclusion that unless the school is assumed by Government, the educational needs

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of the locality will suffer. Sir, it is not correct to say that this is an attempt to fritter away my tax-payers money. The taxpayer is as much mine as the Hon'ble Member for Vadakkancheri.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan (*Vadakkancheri*): He is not mine.

Mr. P. Govinda Menon *(Minister for Food and Education)* Then he is mine. It is my duty to provide money for the educational needs of the locality. Therefore I rightly claim before this House that this demand of Rs. 10,000 for the assumption of management of the Kuttur High School is a legitimate demand, a proper demand, a demand which if not voted for, will put the Government in very great difficulty because it is Government's duty to supply the educational needs of the population throughout the State. Further I want to give one more clarification. I said that the valuation for the new school building and the site is Rs. 5,000. It does not mean that we are going to pay this Rs. 5,000. The Engineering Department and the Diwan Peishkar will value the property and the site and if their recommendations come and if it is only above Rs. 5,000 will it be taken for Rs. 5,000. We are not giving a blank cheque. All the usual procedure is being followed in this case also. Is it the charge against me when the Education Department after having conducted an enquiry in the matter, the Educational Advisory Committee having sat in judgment over the matter and having convinced me and the Government that it is necessary for the requirements of the educational needs of the locality that a school should be conducted there, is it the charge against me that I did not run after private agencies to take up the school. It is none of my duty to do so. The school is necessary there and to conduct this school Government want the above sum and on behalf of Government I request this House to grant that money.

Deputy President : I think the Ayes have it.

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* A poll, Sir.

Ayes

1.	Mr. K. Kochukuttan	2.	Mr. K. K. Kannan
3.	Mrs. K. M. R. Menon	4.	Mrs. Dakshayani Velayudhan
5.	Mr. P. K. Dewer	6.	Mr. Natarajan Chettiar
7.	,, R. S. Thevanna Koundan	8.	,, K. I. Velayudhan
9.	,, K. T. Achuthan	10.	,, K. R. Ramakrishnan
11.	,, M. K. Verghese	12.	,, M. K. Raja
13.	,, P. T. Jacob	14.	,, P. K. Paul
15.	,, P. Sankara Menon	16.	,, V. R. Krishnan Ezhuthassan
17.	,, P. Achutha Menon	18.	,, P. Mani
19.	,, C. S. Panikker	20.	Choudhury Dhara Singh
21.	Rao Bahadur T. K. Nayar	22.	Mr. P. Govinda Menon
23.	Rao Sahib K. Ayyappan	24.	,, C. R. Iyyunni
25.	Rao Sahib P. V. Raphael	26.	,, B. V. K. Menon
27.	Rao Sahib C. J. Mathew	28.	,, K. Govinda Menon
29.	Mr. P. E. Warne		

Noes

1.	Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan	2.	Mr. Jos K. Verghese
3.	,, K. Balakrishna Menon		

VIII. RAISING OF A POINT OF ORDER

Mr. P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan *(Vadakkancheri):* Sir, on a point of order, proviso 2 to section 13 of the rules framed under the Constitution Act which deals with the powers of the members of this Council other than the members except the Advocate General and the Ministers runs thus "provided further that every Minister and the Advocate-General shall have the right to speak in, and otherwise take part in the proceedings of the Council and any Committee of the Council of which they may be named members, but shall not, by virtue of this provision only, be entitled to vote." I raise this point of order that the Ministers who are dealt with and whose powers of taking part in the proceedings of this Council and their powers to speak in this Council which are dealt with by proviso 2 that they shall not along with the Advocate-General who is not unfortunately here vote. I raise that point for a ruling from the Chair. So my position is that on this point of order 4 members' name will have to be removed from the Ayes.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly